Thematic Session proposal on the concept of manner and its linguistic realizations

SLE Conference 2023 - National and Kapodistrian University of Athens

Although 'manner' is a well-known concept in grammatical analysis, it is not easy to pin down: most definitions make reference to the grammatical category of the adverb and have evolved very little over time. Restaut (1773), for instance, defines the manner adverb as an adverb "that expresses how or in what way things are done and which answers the question *how?*". This definition of the manner adverb, and thus of manner itself, is circular however and easily leads to confusion: on the basis of this depiction, one might be tempted to treat *sharp* as a manner adverb in *He spoke to John in a sharp manner*. This is clearly not the case: it is not *sharp* that expresses manner here, no more than the noun *manner* itself, but rather the whole phrase *in a sharp manner*. Moreover, the paraphrase itself is also problematic, as there is no *a priori* evidence for the equivalence between it and the adverb (cf. the awkwardness of paraphrasing *She turned sharply to the left* by ?*She turned to the left in a sharp manner*).

The second and final element of this definition is that the manner adverb answers the question *how?* This method of detecting the presence of manner covers however not only manner, but also instrument, and even notions such as place, time, frequency, etc. (see Duplâtre 2021; Duplâtre & Modicom 2022). This makes 'manner' a term that groups together heterogeneous notions. Rather than helping to define manner, this test therefore only complicates things and even makes this notion impossible to define.

On top of all this, manner is not always referred to in the same way in different languages: while the nouns *manner* and *manière* are used in English and in French, the adjective *modal* is used to refer to this notion in German. Languages such as Spanish and Italian use both the nouns *modo* and *manera/maniera*. However it is not clear that *modo/modal* are more precise than *manière/manner*.

Another question that arises is whether 'manner' is lexical or notional. It is lexical if we consider manner to be latent in or subcategorized by the verb (McConnell-Ginet 1982). On the other hand, it is notional if we see it as implied by an action (Dik 1997).

One may also ask whether manner is prototypically conveyed by an adverb. As the examples below from English and German suggest, it can also be expressed by the verb (see also Stosic 2020):

He is running down the street.
He is driving down the road.
He is racing down the road.
He is limping down the road.

Er läuft die Straße hinunter.
Er fährt die Straße hinunter.
Er rast die Straße hinunter.
Er hinkt die Straße hinunter.

Hence the further question: is it possible to delimit manner syntactically?

Returning to the manner adverb, it would seem that morphology (cf. the adverbial suffixes -*ly* and -*ment*(*e*)) as well as the ability to generate other functions (framing adverbs, degree adverbs, sentence adverbs, etc.), or interpretations (Schäfer 2002) would make the manner adverb the prototype of the adverb category (Ramat/Ricca 1994). Frequency of occurrence, however, belies this claim (Ramat/Ricca 1994). Notwithstanding the frequency facts, the manner adverb is the preferred basis for typological generalizations (Hengeveld 1992a and b; 2004) and it is also the vehicle for a fourth function called "adverbation" (Haspelmath 2012), whereas nouns, verbs and adjectives are roots used respectively for reference, predication and attribution. What is more basic here however – the notion of manner or the grammatical category of adverb, or do both enjoy equal status? Furthermore, if a prototypical adverb modifies the predicate in the same way that an adjective modifies a referent (Haser & Kortmann 2006), does this mean that the adverbial class is reducible to the manner adverb (Duplâtre & Modicom 2022)? One thing is certain: the manner adverb, and by extension the notion of manner itself, must be carefully distinguished from circumstantial indications (Golay 1959, see also König 1995 on converbs). Hence a syntactic question: is the manner adverb really an adjunct?

In general, the manner adverb seems to be defined by two characteristics, one syntactic, the other semantic: it is a lower adverb (Cinque 1999, Laenzlinger 2015) and is close to the nuclear predication (Dik 1997); but it is also defined by the fact that it has several possible orientations (Platt & Platt 1972, Bartsch 1972, Guimier 1991, Duplâtre & Modicom 2022). Can this semantic phenomenon, which is not observed with adverbs of time or place, be explained syntactically?

Finally, if manner adverbs are to be distinguished from secondary predications (Hallonsten Halling 2018), this means that their function must be that of modification. In Croft (2003)'s model, these two functions (modification and predication) are mutually exclusive. However, might there be a way out of this dichotomy: if we treat manner adverbs as representing a function just like reference, predication and modification, could they not combine both (secondary) predication and modification? Concretely, this would mean that manner adverbs could both modify the verb and predicate something of the subject at the same time. Of course, this predication is not explicitly expressed, so that manner adverbs are considered by some authors to be "neutral" with respect to predication (see Geuder 2002). But this possibility appears very clearly in *John opened the door enthusiastically*, where *enthusiastically* "attributes enthusiasm to John" (Jackendoff 1972). At the same time, the question arises whether modification is the proper term to describe the relation between manner adverbs and verbs. Should manner adverbs be considered rather to be "two-place predicates" (Dalrymple 2001), whose arguments would be the subject and the verb? As far as the verb is concerned, do they fit the definition of Dionysius Thrax according to which the *épirrhêma* is a predication on the rheme (Lallot 2003), which would make them secondary predications?

We welcome in this workshop any and all proposals concerning the history of the concept of manner, its definition, its syntactic and pragmatic realizations in any language, whether it be a cross-linguistic study or one devoted only to a particular language. All theoretical frameworks are admissible.

Please submit your proposal before November 5th to both olivier-duplatre@wanadoo.fr and Patrick.Duffley@lli.ulaval.ca

References

BARTSCH, RENATE (1972): *Adverbialsemantik*. Frankfurt am Main: Athenäum Verlag.

CINQUE, GUGLIELMO (1999): *Adverbs and Functional Heads*. Oxford: Oxford University Press.

CROFT, WILLIAM (2003): *Typology and Universals*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

DALRYMPLE, MARY (2001): *Lexical functional grammar*. Leiden/Boston: Brill.

DIK, SIMON C. (1997): *The Theory of Functional Grammar. First Part: The Structure of the Clause*. 2nd edition. Berlin/New York: De Gruyter.

DUPLÂTRE, OLIVIER (2021): Un constituant obligatoire souvent invisible. 33e colloque international du CerLiCO. Université Bordeaux Montaigne. Rennes: Presses Universitaires de Rennes. 85-99.

DUPLÂTRE, OLIVIER & PIERRE-YVES MODICOM (2022): *Adverbs and Adverbials. Categorial Issues*. Berlin: De Gruyter Mouton.

GEUDER, WILHELM (2002): *Oriented Adverbs – Issues in the Lexical Semantics of Event Adverbs*. Dissertation. University of Tübingen.

GOLAY, JEAN-PIERRE (1959): Le complément de manière est-il un complément de circonstance ? *Le Français moderne* 1959/1. Paris: d'Artrey. 65-71.

GUIMIER, CLAUDE (1991): Peut-on définir l'adverbe? In C. Guimier & P. Larcher (ed.), *Les états de l'adverbe*. Travaux linguistiques du CERLICO. 11-34.

HALLONSTEN HALLING, PERNILLA (2018): *Adverbs: a Typological Study of a Disputed Category*. Dissertation. Stockholm University.

HASER, VERENA & BERND KORTMANN (2006): Adverbs. In K. Brown (ed.), *Encyclopedia of Language and Linguistics*. Boston: Elsevier. 66-69.

HASPELMATH, MARTIN (2012): How to compare major word-classes across the world's languages. *UCLA Working Papers in Linguistics, Theories of Everything* 17/16. 109-130.

HENGEVELD, KEES (1992a): Parts of speech. In M. Fortescue, P. Harder & L. Kristoffersen (eds.), *Layered Structure and Reference in a Functional Perspective*. Amsterdam: John Benjamins. 29-53.

HENGEVELD, KEES (1992b): *Nonverbal Predication: Theory, Typology, Diachrony*. Berlin: Mouton de Gruyter.

HENGEVELD, KEES, JAN RIJKHOFF & ANNA SIEWIERSKA (2004): Parts-of-speech systems and word order. *Journal of Linguistics* 40. 527-570.

JACKENDOFF, RAY S. (1972): *Semantic interpretation in generative grammar*. Cambridge/ Massachusetts/London: The MIT Press.

KÖNIG, EKKEHARD (1995): The meaning of converb constructions. In M. Haspelmath & E. König (eds.), *Converbs in Cross-Linguistic Perspective: Structure and Meaning of Adverbial Verb Forms – Adverbial Participles, Gerunds*. Berlin: De Gruyter. 57-96.

LAENZLINGER, CHRISTOPHER (2015): Comparative adverb syntax : A cartographic approach. In: K. Pittner, D. Elsner, F. Barteld (ed.), *Adverbs, Functional and diachronic aspects*. Amsterdam/Philadelphia: John Benjamins Publishing Company. 207-235.

LALLOT, JEAN (2003): *La Grammaire de Denys le Thrace*. 2nd ed. Paris: CNRS Éditions.

McCONNELL-GINET, SALLY (1982): Adverbs and Logical Form : A linguistically realistic theory. *Language* 58/1. 144-184.

PLATT, JOHN T. & HEIDI K. PLATT (1972): Orientation of manner adverbials. *Papers in Linguistics* 51. 227-249.

RAMAT, PAOLO & DAVIDE RICCA (1994): Prototypical adverbs: On the scalarity/radiality of the notion Adverb. *Rivista di Linguistica* 6. 289-326.

RESTAUT, PIERRE (1773): *Principes généraux et raisonnés de la grammaire françoise*. 11th edition. Paris: Lottin.

SCHÄFER, MARTIN (2002): Pure manner adverbs revisited. In G. Katz, S. Reinhard & P. Reuter (eds.), *Sinn & Bedeutung VI, Proceedings of the Sixth Annual Meeting of the Gesellschaft für Semantik.* University of Osnabrück.

STOSIC, DEJAN (2020): Defining the concept of manner: an attempt to order chaos, *Testi e linguaggi* 14. 127-150.